



2019 PSMA POWER SUPPLY SOFTWARE / FIRMWARE RELIABILITY IMPROVEMENT REPORT



***PSMA Power Supply
Software / Firmware
Reliability Improvement Report***

*A Comprehensive Study on Digital Implementations of Power Supplies
Commissioned by the PSMA Board of Directors and Executed by the
PSMA Reliability Committee*

Purpose of the PSMA

The Power Sources Manufacturers Association (PSMA) is a not-for-profit organization incorporated in the state of California. As stated in the papers of incorporation, the purpose of the Association shall be to enhance the stature and reputation of its members and their products; improve their knowledge of technological and other developments related to power sources; and educate the electronics industry, academia, and government and industry agencies as to the importance of, and relevant applications for, all types of power sources and conversion devices.

PSMA Mission

The PSMA mission is to integrate the resources of the power sources industry to more effectively and profitably serve the needs of the power sources users, providers, and PSMA members.

Reliability Committee Mission

In alignment with the PSMA mission of bringing value and utility to members as well as the power electronics industry as a whole, the PSMA Reliability Committee aims to spearhead industry initiatives that identify and attempt to solve the pertinent industry challenges related to the reliability and performance of power supplies and associated products. The scope of the Committee shall include anything that impacts the life and desired application of a power supply, including (but not limited to) interaction with a system and/or other power supplies.

Reliability Report

As with so many things, power electronics are transitioning from analog control to digital control. Power supply designers now need to create and embed software in power supply products. Vendors of power control chips and power control processors have started to provide code. While some is helpful, this software is often not well engineered for software development and software maintenance. Moving from power electronics with analog control to power electronics with digital control is a significant transition and this report attempts to present key finding related to the challenges and solutions to reliability in the of digital control of power electronics.

Software Reliability

Software Reliability is the ability of software to repeatedly perform intended functionality for defined operating condition(s) or environment(s) over a specified length of time. While the focus here is on software reliability, hardware variation and evolution over time impacts software reliability and legacy software function.

High quality software with high reliability requirements is typically implemented following a standards-based regulatory process. Examples of applications where software has strict reliability specifications include aviation control, medical devices, and transport vehicle control.

Power electronics control software is often required to have performance levels as high as aviation software. If the power supply is for use in aviation or other such applications, any safety standards also apply to the power supply control code.

Software engineering best practices are being adopted for digital power electronics control for power supplies to ensure reliability does not suffer with the transition to digital control. Some of these best practices are relatively new, evolving, and unfamiliar in the power electronics world.

Report Structure

This report examines a wide array of problems and challenges in the field of digitally controlled power supplies, then proceeds through observed and proposed improvements and best practices.

- Section 1 is a summary of the typical issues, challenges, and points of failure in digitally controlled power supplies.
- Section 2 covers what best practices are useful for high quality digital power electronics.
- Section 2 addresses the quality of software in digital power electronic power supplies.
- Section 3 contains guidance on design process improvement, allowing development to move toward best practices. Some standards from related and comparable product sectors using processes to achieve high quality software are introduced.
- Section 4 delves into various specifications and templates that support best practices and quality.
- Section 5 describes program management and integration of different engineering cultures and tools to create reliable product.
- Section 6 addresses a range of tests, inspections, types of analysis, plans, and tools that support developing high-quality product.
- Section 7 reviews key metrics from both power hardware and software control backgrounds.
- Section 8 considers some new metrics that might benefit the power supply industry.

Acknowledgements

Special thanks to the authors, contributors, reviewers, and supporters for this report, including:

The PSMA Reliability Committee

- *Co-Chair: Tony O'Brien, Cisco Systems*
- *Co-Chair: Brian Zahnstecher, PowerRox*

The PSMA Office

- *Joe Horzepa*
- *Lisa Horzepa*

ELMG Digital Power (Third-Party Consultant)

PSMA Reliability Subcommittee contributors to this report:

- *Nitish Agarwal, SL Power*
- *Manish Bhardwaj, Texas Instruments*
- *Shane Callanan, Advanced Energy*
- *Ada Cheng, AdaClock*
- *Rick Fishbune, IBM*
- *Hamish Laird, ELMG Digital Power*
- *Bill Mallory, SL Power*
- *Ed Massey, Massey Consulting*
- *Greg Miller, Sarda Technologies*
- *Steve Miller, SL Power*
- *Shobhana Punjabi, Cisco Systems*
- *Michael Seeman, Eta One Power*
- *Eric Swenson, IBM*

Additional reviewers for this report:

- *Pasi Lauronen, Efore (Representing EPSMA)*
- *Nitya Ramdas, Texas Instruments (Representing PMBus™)*
- *Devin Cottier, Texas Instruments*

A huge thanks to the PSMA Board of Directors and organization for funding this study and supporting its dissemination to the industry in the spirit of driving systemic industry communication and improvement, in accordance with the PSMA and Reliability Committee missions.

PSMA Reliability Committee

Committee Chairs

Brian Zahnstecher, PowerRox

Tony O'Brien, Cisco

Committee Members

Ada Cheng, AdaClock

Rick Fishbune, IBM

Patrick Le Fèvre, Powerbox

Tim McDonald, Infineon

Steve Miller, SL Power

Bill Mallory, SL Power

Nitish Agarwal, SL Power

Greg Miller, Sarda

Mike Seeman, Eta One Power

Ed Massey, Massey Consulting

Eric Swenson, IBM

Finbarr Waldron, Tyndall National Institute

Jon Fifield, Astronics

Kevin Parmenter, Taiwan Semi

Huai Wang, Aalborg University

Dao Zhou, Aalborg University

Burak Ozpineci, ORNL

Shobhana Punjabi, Cisco

Patrick McCluskey, University of MD, CALCE Lab

Abhijit Dasgupta, University of MD, CALCE Lab

Francesco Carobolante, IoTissimo

Shane Callanan, AEI

Hamish Laird, ELMG Digital Power

Manish Bhardwaj, Texas Instruments

Evan Lucore, Artesyn

Table of Contents

- Table of Contents 9**
- 1. Reliability Challenges..... 14**
 - 1.1 PWM Timer Precision 14
 - 1.2 VPO Timer Precision..... 16
 - 1.3 LLC Power Supply Digital Control..... 18
 - 1.4 Digital Integrator Types..... 18
 - 1.5 All Sum Integrators..... 19
 - 1.6 Integrator Precision Loss 20
 - 1.7 Single Sample Noise..... 21
 - 1.8 IIR Filter Type — DFT II Second Order 23
 - 1.9 Limited Number of Bits..... 23
 - 1.10 Converter Non-Linearity 24
 - 1.11 Digital System Inherent Non-Linearity 26
 - 1.12 Dynamic Range and Precision Trade-Offs 27
 - 1.13 Coefficient Quantification and Instability..... 27
 - 1.14 System Stability Assessment in Small Signal..... 27
 - 1.15 In-Band Noise Spectrum..... 28
 - 1.16 Converter Parallel Connection..... 29
 - 1.17 Over-Current Detection and Current Limiting with Digital Systems..... 30
 - 1.18 Over-Voltage Detection with Digital Systems..... 30
 - 1.19 Accurately Predicting the Processing Power Required 31
 - 1.20 Assessing the Suitability of ADCs 31
 - 1.21 Choosing ADC Number of Bits 34
 - 1.22 Measuring the Frequency Response..... 34
 - 1.23 Calibrating the Controller in Measuring Response..... 35
 - 1.24 Recognizing Phase Dependency in Frequency Response 35
 - 1.25 Managing Software Versioning..... 36
 - 1.26 Direct Digital Design of Compensators 37
 - 1.27 Choosing the Sampling Rate 37
 - 1.28 Sample Rates for Variable Frequency Converters — Assessing the Potential Aliasing Products 38
 - 1.29 Aliasing Product Magnitude Assessment..... 39
 - 1.30 Transient Over-Voltage / Anti-Aliasing Filter 39
 - 1.31 Power Converter Design for Control..... 40
 - 1.32 No Method to Measure System Response 41
 - 1.33 Closed-Loop Response Measurement not Representing Open-Loop Response..... 41
 - 1.34 Frequency Response Measurement Inaccuracy 42
 - 1.35 Calibration of Frequency Response Measurement Inaccuracy 42
 - 1.36 Verification Testing for Filters 43
 - 1.37 Incomplete Filter Testing..... 44
 - 1.38 Testing Filter with Generic Coefficients 45
 - 1.39 Verification Testing for Compensators 45

1.40	Verification Testing for Software.....	45
1.41	Coefficient Adjustment.....	46
1.42	Converter Variation	47
1.43	Developing Software in a Team	48
1.44	Managing Software Verification Testing.....	48
1.45	Automating Software Verification Testing	49
1.46	Software Quality Planning.....	50
1.47	Test Planning.....	51
1.48	Choosing Development Platforms and Coordinating Production Hardware	52
1.49	Software Coders Designing Control Systems	52
1.50	Software Release.....	53
1.51	Software Version Reporting	53
1.52	Having Software Self-Report Version	54
1.53	Wrong Software Version in the Field.....	54
1.54	Verification Testing Result Tracking	55
1.55	Verification Result Analysis.....	55
1.56	Verification Result Pass-Fail Criteria.....	56
1.57	Production Component Variation.....	56
1.58	Production Component Substitution	57
1.59	Start-up Transient Over Currents	57
1.60	Mode Change Transients, Abnormal Operation, Fault Response, and Recovery	58
1.61	Mode Change Converter Gain Changes.....	59
1.62	Synchronous Rectifier Enable / Disable Transient	60
1.63	Synchronous Rectifier Enable / Disable Transient with Parallel Converters.....	60
1.64	Paralleled Converter Connection.....	61
1.65	No Production Monitoring on Control Margins	62
1.66	Fault Masking	62
1.67	Communication Links	63
1.68	Analog Filter on Communication Bus	63
1.69	Communication Bus Noise Filter Exceeds Bus Timing Limits	64
1.70	References	64
2.	Best Practices	66
2.1	Design Partition	66
2.2	Team Capability.....	66
2.3	Converter Design for Control	68
2.4	Version Control.....	68
2.5	Build Server	68
2.6	Verification Test Plan	69
2.7	Verification Testing	69
2.8	Code Inspection	69
2.9	Reasons for Code Inspection Reviews	69
2.10	Release Process	70
2.11	Project Tracking.....	70
2.12	Coding Standards	70

2.13	Code Design Standard Sources	71
2.14	Code Review	71
2.15	Code Escrow	71
2.16	Team Structures	72
2.17	Language of Digital Power Control	72
2.18	Cultures of Power Electronics and Software.....	72
2.19	Specification of Digitally Controlled Power Supply	72
2.20	EMC Testing.....	73
2.21	Processor Choice Process	73
2.22	References	73
3.	Design Process Improvement	76
3.1	Code Versioning Guide	76
3.2	Coding Standards	79
3.3	Code Inspection and Review Guide	82
3.4	Specification Process	83
3.5	Software Architecture and Design Process	86
3.6	Code Test Planning.....	87
3.7	Code Release Process	90
3.8	Hardware Software Interfacing Process	91
3.9	Hardware Design for Power Converters Controlled Digitally.....	91
3.10	Risk Management Process.....	92
3.11	References	94
4.	Functional and Other Specifications	96
4.1	Vendor and Supplier Specifications	96
4.2	Example Software Quality Specification	98
4.3	Software Development Process Assessment Template	101
4.4	Software Security Assessment Specification	104
4.5	Digital PSU Verification Test Plan Example.....	106
4.6	Development Team Specifications.....	110
4.7	PSU Functional Partition Specification Template	111
4.8	Software Interface Specification Template	111
4.9	Power Electronic Interface Specification	112
4.10	References	112
5.	Program Management Process	114
5.1	Team Structures and Team Cultures	114
5.2	Digital Power Team Communication.....	115
5.3	Managing Digital Power Teams	117
5.4	Power Electronics Team Management.....	119
5.5	Digital Hardware Team Management	120
5.6	Recommendations on Best Management Practice	121
5.7	Challenges in the Team Structure.....	122
5.8	Software Practices, Including Change Management	123
5.9	Power Electronics and Software Culture Clashes.....	124
5.10	Change Management for Managers and Teams.....	124

5.11	References	126
6.	Test and Qualification Plans.....	128
6.1	Test and Qualification for Power Electronics Hardware	129
6.2	Design Validation	130
6.3	Test and Qualification for Digital Power Electronics Control.....	131
6.4	Template for a Software Inspection Plan	133
6.5	Return on Investment for Code Inspection	136
6.6	Use of Testing in Design and Coding	136
6.7	Functional Test Plans.....	137
6.8	Compliance Test Plans	137
6.9	Requirements Test Plans.....	138
6.10	References	138
7.	Key Metrics	140
7.1	Efficiency	140
7.2	Voltage Regulation	140
7.3	Voltage Ripple	140
7.4	Temperature Rise	140
7.5	Operating Temperature Range	140
7.6	THD and Harmonic Content AC Input	141
7.7	Phase Margin	141
7.8	Gain Margin	141
7.9	In-Band Gain.....	141
7.10	PSRR.....	141
7.11	Psophometric Noise	141
7.12	HALT Failure Limits.....	141
7.13	Vibration Withstand.....	142
7.14	Shock Withstand	142
7.15	EMC Performance	142
7.16	Software Development Established Metrics	142
7.17	References	150
8.	Proposed Industry Metrics	152
8.1	Useful Software Development Established Metrics	152
8.2	Predicted Defect Rate	152
8.3	Defect Discovery Rate.....	152
8.4	Defect Resolution Rate	152
8.5	Defect Rate as Trigger for Release.....	153
8.6	Code Complexity Assessment.....	154
8.7	Software Quality Assessment.....	155
8.8	Conclusion	160
8.9	References	160
9.	Glossary.....	162